Annotation Supporting Collaborative Development of Scholarly Editions

Anna Gerber
agerber@itee.uq.edu.au

Jane Hunter
jane@itee.uq.edu.au

This research was funded by the Andrew W. Mellon Foundation.
AustLit

- AustLit is a partnership between the National Library of Australia and twelve universities
- Data model based on IFLA FRBR
- Aus-e-Lit tools and services build on AustLit web portal
Aus-e-Lit System Architecture

Research Sub-Community

Researchers annotating a subset of the AusLit collection

Secure Authentication

Authenticated Annotation Service

Periodically harvested annotations

OAI-PMH Annotation Server

Harvested Metadata Store

Augmented Metadata

Search Services

Annotation Services

Compound-Object Services

AustLit Portal

ASAL Community

SETIS

NBD

Picture Australia

Annotation Supporting Collaborative Development of Scholarly Editions
Anna Gerber, Jane Hunter
Overview

• Aus-e-Lit annotation service
• What is a Scholarly Edition
• Annotation examples
  – Explanatory Note & Reply
  – Textual Note (re-use of existing body, different creators)
  – Textual Note linking facsimile (multiple targets)
  – Annotating Textual Variation (multiple targets, compound body)
• Challenges, Discussion points
Aus-e-Lit Annotation service

- Enables annotation of
  - Web resources:
    - HTML, plain text, images
  - AustLit entities:
    - Agents, Works, Expressions, Manifestations
- Open source Firefox add-on (LORE)
- Uses Danno Annotation Server (Annotea-based)

Aus-e-Lit Annotation service

• Annotea annotation types supported:
  – Question, Comment, Explanation, Reply

• Annotation bodies:
  – HTML (with formatting and links or embedded images)
  – Tags (URIs)
  – Freeform keywords (literals)
  – OWL property instances (when annotating AustLit entities only)

• Can export annotations to OAC alpha 3 model
  – Moving towards OAC as primary annotation model
Annotation Supporting Collaborative Development of Scholarly Editions
Anna Gerber, Jane Hunter
Scholarly Editions

- Provide bibliographic information for authoritative versions of a work (e.g. poem, novel, collection of stories)
- Record variants among the versions
- Describe the composition, revision and production of the work throughout these versions
- Explain the historical context of the work
- Annotate obscure references, errors

(Shillingsburg)
Example Edition


Reliable text

Apparatus

first whether the bushrangers will be caught; where they’re gone to that the police can’t get ’em; how it was that one of ’em was so kind to the young lady as to give her new watch back, and whether Captain Starlight was as handsome as people say, and if Mrs. Buxter will ever get her watch back, with the big reward the Government offered. More than that, whether they’ll stick up more coaches or fly the country.”

“I’d like to have been there and ‘seen how Bill ‘Driver’ looked,” says Maddie. “He was here one day since, and kept gassin’ about it all as if he wouldn’t let none of you do anything he liked. I didn’t think he was that game, and told him so. He said I’d better take a seat some day and see how I liked it. I asked him wasn’t they all very good-looking chaps, and he said Starlight was gentle lookin’, but there was one great, big, rough-looking feller—that was you, Jim—as was ugly enough to turn a cask of beer sour.”

“I’ll give him a hammerin’ for that yet,” grumbles old Jim. “My word, he was that shaky and blue-lookin’ he didn’t know whether I was white or black.”

We had a great spree that night in a quiet way, and got all the fun as was to be had under the circumstances. Barnes came out with some pretty good wine which Starlight shouted for all round. The old woman cooked us a stunning good dinner, which we made the girls sit down to and some cousins of theirs that lived close by. We were merry enough before the evening was out. Bella Barnes played the piano middling, and Maddie could sing first-rate, and all of them could dance. The last thing I recollect was Starlight showing Maddie what he called a minuet step, and Jonathan and the old woman sitting on the sofa as grave as owls.

Anyhow we all enjoyed ourselves. It was a grand change after being so long alone. The girls romped and laughed and pretended to be offended every now and then, but we had a regular good lark of it and didn’t feel any the worse at daylight next morning.

Jim and I were away before sunrise, and after we’d once got on the road that Jonathan showed us we got on well enough. We were dressed just like common bushmen. There were plenty on the road just then bringing cattle and horses to the diggings. It was well

[Driver] Webster *Er*.

*rough-lookin* *Et L3* 

*feller* *fellow* *Et*
Sample Scholarly Editing Process

1. Collation and initial reading of primary sources
2. Second reading of primary sources and gathering of secondary sources e.g. critical and historical essays
3. Discussion with colleagues, collaborators
4. Study of secondary sources

5. Refinement of editorial rationale and selection of notes and secondary sources to include
6. Writing essay, editing of text
7. Submission to publisher
8. Respond to readers’ reports
9. Publication

Note taking and refinement / expansion of notes occurs during the first four phases
Annotations to Support Scholarly Editing

• Record notes and annotate variations:
  – Provide additional information about Textual Variations
  – Textual notes (about production of text)
  – Explanatory notes (meaning, historical context, glossary etc)
  – Link texts with facsimiles, reference secondary sources

• Facilitate collaborative discussion of texts, sources and facsimiles
  – Comments, Questions, Replies
He had to sacrifice the remnant of his flock and go droving again. He intends to move his family into the nearest town when he comes back, and, in the meantime, his brother, who lives on the main road, comes over about once a month with provisions. The wife has still a couple of cows, one horse, and a few sheep. The brother-in-law kills one of the latter occasionally, gives her what she needs of it, and takes the rest in return for other provisions.

She is used to being left alone. She once lived like this for eighteen months. As a girl, she built the usual air-castles, but all her girlish hopes and aspirations are dead. She finds all the excitement and recreation she needs in the Young Ladies Journal, and—Heaven help her!—takes a pleasure in the fashion-plates.

Her husband is an Australian, and so is she. He is careless, but a good enough husband. If he had the means, he would take her to the city and keep her there like a princess. They are used to being apart, or at least she is. "No use frettin'," she says. He may forget sometimes that he is married; but if he has a good cheque when he comes back, he will give most of it to her. When he had money, he took her
Example: Explanatory Note and Reply

- We extend OAC by subclassing oac:Annotation e.g.
  - lit:ExplanatoryNote
  - lit:TextualNote
  - lit:VariationAnnotation
Explanatory Note RDF

<http://auselit.metadata.net/danno/annotea/73FF96027D8D402D>  
a oac:Annotation;  
a lit:ExplanatoryNote;  
dc:language "en";  
dc:title "Young Ladies Journal";  
dcterms:created "2009-09-15T18:25:12.915-07:00";  
dcterms:creator [  
a foaf:Agent;  
foaf:name "Roger Osborne" ];  
dcterms:modified "2009-09-15T18:29:21.584-07:00";  
oac:hasBody  
<http://auselit.metadata.net/danno/annotea/body/1C41B1C9E18CEB63>;  
oac:hasTarget  
<http://www.austlit.edu.au/common/loredemo/asal/bullstory.html#xpoin
ter(string-range(...))> .
Reply RDF

This reply represents a tag (body is a term from the AustLit thesaurus)

<http://auselit.metadata.net/danno/annotea/6A944B808E9B7E25>
  a oac:Reply;
  dc:language "en";
  dc:title "Re: Young Ladies Journal";
  dcterms:created "2010-06-20T04:06:00.833-07:00";
  dcterms:creator [ 
    a foaf:Agent;
    foaf:name "Anna Gerber" ];
  dcterms:modified "2010-06-20T04:06:00.833-07:00";
  oac:hasBody <http://austlit.edu.au/thesaurus/MagazineCovers>;
  oac:hasTarget <http://auselit.metadata.net/danno/annotea/73FF96027D8D402D> .
Example: Re-using Existing Content

A1 is of type lit:TextualNote (extends oac:Annotation)
U1, U2 of type foaf:Agent
CT1 is of type oac:ConstrainedTarget

• Re-use of textual note from an existing electronic edition as annotation body
• Example of custom RDF constraint to address text segment
Example: Textual Note Linking Facsimile

- Multiple targets

```
<http://auselit.metadata.net/danno/annotatea/187BE7F7CE3A43FD>
  a oac:Annotation;
  a lit:TextualNote;
  oac:hasBody
  <http://auselit.metadata.net/danno/annotatea/body/9480BEB601FB9424>;
  oac:hasTarget
  oac:hasTarget
```
Annotating Textual Variation

Editor may indicate:

- Agent or source of change e.g.
  - Intentional: editorial intervention; author revision; censorship
  - Error
  - Location
  - Date
  - Notes or explanation

Emendations from Boldrewood, Rolf, & Eggert, Paul, & Webby, Elizabeth. & Australian Academy of the Humanities. 2006, Robbery under arms / Rolf Boldrewood; edited by Paul Eggert and Elizabeth Webby University of Queensland Press, St. Lucia, Qld.
Annotation Supporting Collaborative Development of Scholarly Editions
Anna Gerber, Jane Hunter
Example: Annotating Textual Variation

Body is OAI-ORE aggregation, allowing attachment of

- relationships between targets
- metadata e.g. variation place, agent, date
Specifying relationships within the aggregate body

• Relationships between target resources e.g. between two segments of versions of a text

• Relationships to secondary sources, facsimile or other resources, e.g:
  • has_transcript
  • has_serialisation
  • has_manuscript
  • is_facsimile_of
  • has_dust_jacket
Collation tools

• Collation tools assist editors to compare a number of versions of a text and to produce apparatus

• Examples of collation & alignment software
  – PC-CASE, MacCASE, COLLATE, EPPT, DV-COLL, TUSTEP, Versioning Machine, TextGrid, CollateX, MEDITE, JUXTA, Nmerge (Multi-Version Documents (MVD))
Multi-Version Documents (MVD)

“The Multi-Version Document or MVD model represents all the versions of a work, whether they arise from corrections to a text or from the copying of one original text into several variant versions, or some combination of the two, as four atomic operations: insertion, deletion, substitution and transposition”

- Schmidt, Desmond (2010)
  *The inadequacy of embedded markup for cultural heritage texts.*

http://www.mvdttestbed.net/

**MVD-GUI**
Annotate MVD Variations

• Aim to demonstrate how editors might annotate machine-computed variations using OAC model through Aus-e-Lit Annotation tool

• Proposed approach:
  – Embed RDFa/additional identifiers in HTML rendered by MVD-GUI
  – Aus-e-Lit annotation tool hooks into RDFa to provide UI for selecting and annotating variations of interest
  – Provide flexible Annotation editing UI to allow (human) editor to attach explanation or additional metadata
Challenges, Discussion Points

• Addressing segments of texts across formats (TEI XML, plain text, HTML etc)
  – Fragment identifiers e.g. xpointer (for TEI XML, HTML)
  – Document offsets
  – Annotating underlying document (e.g. TEI) via rendered view: segment should refer to underlying structure not presentation mark-up: use RDFa/identifiers from TEI

• Retrieve annotations across multiple versions of a text

• Search over aggregate bodies/targets
  – maintain compatibility with basic clients

• Annotation ontology for Annotation types e.g. Keyword/Tag, Comment, Question
Acknowledgements

• Dr Roger Osborne
  School of English, Media Studies & Art History
  The University of Queensland

• Professor Paul Eggert
  School of Humanities & Social Sciences
  University of New South Wales

• Dr Desmond Schmidt
  ISI, Queensland University of Technology

• Damien Ayers
  Aus-e-Lit, The University of Queensland

• Tim Cole, Tom Habing, Bernhard Haslhofer, Ray Larson, Cliff Lynch, Michael Nelson, Doug Reside, Robert Sanderson, Herbert Van de Sompel (OAC)